



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC)  
 Citizens' Advisory Committee (CAC)  
 Power Subcommittee**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Tuesday, June 11, 2019  
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.  
 525 Golden Gate Ave., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Tuolumne Conference Room**

**Mission:** The Power Subcommittee shall review power generation and transmission system reliability and improvement programs, including but not limited to facilities siting and alternatives energy programs, as well as other relevant plans, programs, and policies ([Admin Code 5.140-142](#)).

**Members**

<b>Chair Nate Kinsey</b> <b>(M-Large Water User)</b>	Wendy Aragon (D1)	Jim McHugh (D4)
Moises Garcia (D9)	Mark Tang (M-Eng./Financial)	

M = Mayoral appointment, B = Board President Appointment

Staff Liaisons: Tracy Zhu and Sabrie Grays

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**1. Call to order and roll call**

**Members present at roll call:** (3) Kinsey, Tang, McHugh

**Members Absent:** (2) Garcia, Aragon

**2. Approve April 9, 2019 Minutes**

Motion was made (Tang) and seconded (McHugh) to approve April 9, 2019 minutes

AYES: (3) Kinsey, Tang, McHugh

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (2) Garcia, Aragon

**3. Report from the Chair**

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- The regular Power CAC meetings will be changing their regular meeting days to the first Tuesday of the scheduled month starting in August

**London N. Breed**  
Mayor

**Ann Moller Caen**  
President

**Francesca Vietor**  
Vice President

**Anson Moran**  
Commissioner

**Sophie Maxwell**  
Commissioner

**Tim Paulson**  
Commissioner

**Harlan L. Kelly, Jr.**  
General Manager



Public Comment: None

4. **Public Comment on items not on the agenda:** None

**Member Garcia arrives at 5:37pm (quorum is maintained).**

5. **Presentation and Discussion:** CleanPowerSF Growth Plan Update, Michael Hyams, Director of CleanPowerSF, Power Enterprise

**Presentation Topics:**

- Growth Plan Update
  - CleanPowerSF Enrollment Status
  - CleanPowerSF Enrollment Before July 2018 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Load Shape Before July 2018 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Enrollment After July 2018 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Load Shape After July 2018 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Enrollment After April 2019 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Load Shape After April 2019 Enrollment
  - CleanPowerSF Load Shape Before and After Recent Enrollments

**Discussion Topics:**

- *Chair Kinsey* inquired that after the first round of contracts, what percentage of CleanPowerSF's energy demand is under contract? *Staff Hyams* replied that we are under contract for 100% of our energy demand. Examples of our specified contracts with plants are Calpine's Geothermal Geysers, Shiloh's wind project, S-Power's solar project in northern LA county. Our goal is to enter into enough contracts so that we don't have to go into the open market for power.
- *Member Garcia* asked is there any expectation that the load curve move up or down.
- *Staff Hyams* replied that we would be look at programs or incentives to reduce demand overall or shift demand to the beginning or middle of the day.

Public Comment: None

6. **Presentation and Discussion:** Proposed Commercial Building Renewable Energy Targets, Michael Hyams, Director of CleanPowerSF, Power Enterprise

**Presentation Topics:**

- Earth Day Announcement
  - "San Francisco Mayor Unveils 100 Percent Renewable Power Plan for Downtown"
  - "San Francisco to power commercial buildings with 100% renewables"
- Proposal would require non-residential buildings greater than 50,000 square feet to source their electricity from resources that are 100% renewable and/or GHG-free.
- Schedule depends on size of building
  - 500,000 square feet and above by the end of 2022 – 50 buildings uses 22% of the city's commercial building energy use

- 250,000 square feet and above by the end of 2024 – 166 buildings uses 40% of the city’s commercial building energy use
- 50,000 square feet and above by the end of 2030 – 732 buildings uses 40% of the city’s commercial building energy use
- Direct access is a part of the retail power market that was created in the 1980s that customers – typically commercial – participated in to source their power from third parties
- During the energy crisis, California limited the number of providers to existing providers. Most recently, more providers have been allowed to enter the market.
- About 11% of the city’s electricity load is on direct access providers.

**Discussion Topics:**

- *Member McHugh* asked when will the Mayor introduce the legislation. *Staff Hyams* responded very soon.
- *Chair Kinsey* asked if customers will have to secure renewable energy sources by the end of calendar year or fiscal year. *Staff Hyams* responded that applicable commercial customers will have to demonstrate that they have plans to secure a renewable energy source by the end of the calendar year with delivery starting in the following year.
- *Chair Kinsey* inquired if all the city streetlights are served by Hetch Hetchy Power. *Staff Hyams* replied that all city streetlights are served by Hetch Hetchy Power. Some streetlights are owned and maintained by SFPUC and others are owned and maintained by PG&E.

Public Comment: None

7. **Presentation and Discussion: CleanPowerSF Equity Working Group,**  
 Julia Allman, Utility Specialist and Kaitlin McGee, Utility Analyst,  
 CleanPowerSF, Power Enterprise

**Presentation Topics:**

- Project Overview: Objective and Milestones to Date
- Definition of energy equity
- Phase 1: Community Engagement Planning (in progress)
- Phase 2: Community Engagement & Customer Program Analysis
- Phase 3: Framework in Action

**Discussion Topics:**

- *Member Tang* is really impressed with the Equity Working Group work. His employer Bay Area Air Quality Management District has opportunities to fund community-based organizations to support the implementation AB 617, to reduce emissions from point sources. *Staff Allman* observed that SF has fewer point source pollution sources like power plants, but would like to ensure that communities are equitably benefitting or being served.
- *Chair Kinsey* how do you distinguish between programs and policies, and what are internal versus external policies? *Staff McGee* answered programs tend to be outward facing targeting our customers, but there may be overlaps between programs and policies. For example, a program policy regarding how and when to rollout CleanPowerSF to CARE customers. CARE is a state program that is administered by PG&E

- *Member Garcia* is there a high level summary of the literature review?  
*Staff McGee* responded that the goal is to complete the literature review by the end of the month. Not only are they looking at energy issues and cost burden, they are also looking at equity issues broadly throughout San Francisco like cost of living.  
*Staff Allman* comments that we are looking at things like the equity indicators project that was created by Oakland. When we are creating an equity framework, we are looking at case studies and theoretical frameworks to make sure we are asking the right questions.
- *Staff Zhu* asked what is the policy around enrolling CARE customers.  
*Staff McGee* responded initially there was a strategy of enrolling by district but now all customers have been enrolled including CARE customers. When they get enrolled there is no disruption in their CARE discount.
- *Staff Zhu* asked since the CARE discount is applied to on the transmission and distribution portion of the bill, are customers bills going up after they get enrolled in CleanPowerSF since the discount doesn't apply to the energy generation portion of the bill.  
*Staff Allman* indicated that the CARE discount never applied to the energy generation portion of the bill, so customers' bill should largely remain unchanged.
- *Member Garcia* mentioned that the equity definition doesn't include sexual orientation.  
*Staff Allman* responded that the definition is evolving and staff hopes to continue to refine it.
- *Chair Kinsey* requested that the Equity Working Group come back to the Full CAC after September.
- *Staff Zhu* reminded members that the Equity Working Group's work is funded by Board of Supervisors' add back funding.  
*Member Garcia* asked what would be the need for future add back funding.  
*Staff McGee* said that originally there was a plan to run a pilot program but the emphasis currently has been on no cost policies, no cost programs. They are trying to be creative and efficient, but additional funding could fund a pilot program for incentives, for example.
- *Member Garcia* asked if \$100,000 per year for community engagement was enough.  
*Staff McGee* said that the funds would be prioritized to fund community groups other than the consultants, and SFPUC staff would hold those relationships with community groups.

Public Comment: None

#### 8. Staff report

- Starting August 2019, the Power CAC will meet regularly on the first Tuesday of the scheduled month.
- Special meeting for the Full CAC is Saturday, July 20 – Northpoint Wet Weather Facility Tour
- CAC Leadership Retreat is on Sunday, August 18
- Full CAC meeting is on Tuesday, August 20

Public Comment: None

#### 9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- PG&E Update – priority for August
- Power Interconnection Update to the Board of Supervisors – priority for August

- San Francisco's Climate Action Plan
- Equity Working Group Update – refer to the Full CAC after Phase 1 has been completed
- Air pollution monitoring
- Community Choice Aggregation (CCA) speakers
- CleanPowerSF Outreach
- Future Programs
- Program Development i.e. Electric Vehicles, Electrification, Multi-family Buildings, Storage, Time of Use Rates
- Low-Income Assistance Program
- Regulatory and Legislative Priorities

Public Comment: None

10. **Announcements/Comments** – The next scheduled Power CAC meeting is August 6, 2019. Visit [www.sfwater.org/cac](http://www.sfwater.org/cac) for confirmation of the next scheduled meeting.

Public Comment: None

11. **Adjournment**

Motion was made (Tang) and seconded (Garcia) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 7:02pm.